



WATERFRONT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Town of Germantown, NY

GermantownWaterfrontCommittee@gmail.com

Via email: cr@dos.ny.gov

May 1, 2018

Matthew P. Margaglio
Coastal Resource Specialist 1
Consistency Review Unit
New York State Department of State
Office of Planning, Development & Community Infrastructure
One Commerce Plaza
99 Washington Avenue
Albany, NY 12231

Re: F-2018-0060: Amtrak-proposed fences and gates, Comment Letter 2

Dear Mr. Margaglio:

On April 11, 2018, the Town of Germantown Waterfront Advisory Committee (WAC) issued a comment letter outlining our planned response to Amtrak's proposal to install gates and fences restricting access to miles of the Germantown shoreline. We planned to issue (4) white papers, (2) of which have already been submitted. We've explained the potential impact to the Town¹, and we've detailed the various ways we find the proposal incomplete, inaccurate, and inconsistent with New York State Coastal Management Plan². We now understand that Amtrak has agreed to hold public meetings to provide details of the plan and hear from stakeholders. As such, we have chosen not to rush our final two white papers. We will continue to collect more data regarding the undemonstrated need for these fences, and our community's vision for the future.

Instead, on behalf of the committee I would like to take this opportunity to thank our various supporters before the close of this round of public comment:

- First and foremost, thank you to all Waterfront Advisory Committee members and volunteers for giving your time and expertise to this cause.
- Thank you to the thousands who have signed petitions (449 signers on one³, and 1,610 signers on another⁴ change.org petition), written letters (approximately 200-300), or submitted post cards expressing disapproval for this proposal during this comment period.
- Thank you to the Germantown Telephone Company for donating email address gates@gtel.net to our committee so that we could collect emailed comments as they are submitted and use them to summarize the peoples' concerns in our white papers.
- Thank you to the roughly 150 people who attended our Earth Day River rally on April 22.

¹ "Potential Impacts to the Town of Germantown Shoreline" *Town of Germantown Waterfront Advisory Committee*. April 15, 2018 <http://gatesgate.org/white-paper-potential-impacts/>

² "Amtrak's Inaccurate and Incomplete Consistency Assessment." *Town of Germantown Waterfront Advisory Committee*. April 23, 2018 <http://gatesgate.org/white-paper-two-amtraks-inaccurate-and-incomplete-consistency-assessment/>

³ "Stop Amtrak's Fence Along the Hudson!" <https://www.change.org/p/amtrak-stop-amtrak-s-fence-along-the-hudson>

⁴ "Attention fishermen and women" <https://www.change.org/p/daniel-huber-attention-fishermen-and-women>



WATERFRONT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Town of Germantown, NY

GermantownWaterfrontCommittee@gmail.com

- Thank you to Tin Horn Uprising for the festive rally music, to Regina for singing our national anthem, to Pulcher Transportation for donating a shuttle bus and to Town Clerk Vale for volunteering to driving the bus.
- Thank you to our local artists who have helped create outreach materials, including photographer Andi State, graphic designer Jason Smith, the late photographer Howard Gibson and Bruce Bohnsack for recovering, digitizing, and distributing his Gibson's work.
- Thank you to all the local businesses who helped spread the word about the Amtrak proposal and facilitated the submission of comments by providing post cards, including Gaskin's, Otto's, Home/Made Hudson, and Good Fight Herb Company.
- Thank you to all the journalists who have also helped us spread the word about Amtrak's proposal and our reasons for opposing the proposal.
- Thank you to the other municipal leaders who joined us in penning letters of disapproval over this project, including Dutchess County Executive Molinaro, Town of Rhinebeck Supervisor Spinzia, Village of Tivoli Mayor Griffith, Town of Livingston Supervisor Guzzi, Town of Clermont Supervisor Staats, Town of Stockport Supervisor Drabick, Town of Stuyvesant Supervisor Knott.
- Thank you to the Village of Castleton-on-Hudson Mayor Schmidt and Trustee Giuliano for standing in solidarity with Germantown and holding a parallel rally on April 22 at the gates to their riverfront park, which have been unjustifiably locked for decades.
- Thank you to the former Town of Germantown Supervisor Sharpe for lobbying to have public access restored in 2001, and thank you to our current Supervisor Beaury for jumping to all-hands-on-deck support for our cause.
- Thank you to NYS Senator Marchione and NYS Assemblymember Barrett for joining us at our rally and demonstrating strong, bipartisan support for our cause.
- Thank you to Riverkeeper, Scenic Hudson, Trout Unlimited, the Columbia County Sportsmen's Federation, and the Germantown Sportsmen's Association for also speaking at our rally and demanding that river access be preserved for our people.
- Thank you to the Germantown Fire Department and the Germantown Police Department for helping us plan and carry out our rally safely. Additionally, thank you for always being there when we need you, particularly when we are spending time down by the river.
- Thank you to the Amtrak worker who helped supervise our rally, and to all Amtrak employees who maintain the tracks and crossings to keep us safe.
- Thank you to US Representative Faso for bringing interested parties together last Tuesday April 24 and encouraging Amtrak to hold public meetings.
- Thank you to the NYSDOS for inspiring and funding Germantown to revitalize our waterfront, particularly our project manager Lisa Vasilakos.
- Thank you to our LWRS engineering consultants Kathleen Tatara and Lindsay Ostrander Allen of Delaware Engineering for guiding our grant so beautifully. We especially thank Kathie for her continued personal support after our contract had been completed.



WATERFRONT ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Town of Germantown, NY

GermantownWaterfrontCommittee@gmail.com

- Finally, thank you to Matthew Margaglio and other NYSDOS representatives for listening during this public comment period. If you've read the letters and comments that I've seen submitted, you could not possibly find this proposal consistent with the NYS Coastal Management Plan.

With the sheer number of people and organizations who have joined us in opposing this proposal, it is inevitable that I have forgotten someone. To that, I say thank you to everyone else. It's rare to have a cause that brings our community together as much as opposition to this proposal has these last couple of months. We look forward to productive meetings with Amtrak in the coming weeks.

Sincerely,

Jennifer Crawford, EIT, Chairperson
The Town of Germantown
Waterfront Advisory Committee

Martin Overington, Committee Member

Kaare Christian, Committee Member

Christina Bohnsack, Committee Member

William Shannon, Committee Member

Philip O. Williams, Committee Member

Cc: Claudia Taccetta, Amtrak Lead Environmental Specialist
Robert Beaury, Town of Germantown Supervisor
Andrew Cuomo, New York State Governor